



PERFORMANCE EVALUATIONS FOR PERSONNEL APRIL, 2022

Presenter

Rich Zuker

Director of HR

Ottawa Area ISD

EVALUATION PARADOX

Evaluation is a “top-three” most important task
a supervisor performs in their role.....

...yet one of the most avoided tasks on the
Supervisor’s to-do list.

Agree? Disagree? Why?

TRADITIONAL EMPLOYEE EVALUATION...WORTH THE EFFORT?

Answer: Seldom, and primarily for the purposes of finding exception...

BUT IT CAN BE..... STAY TUNED!

So, given most situations, why do we do evaluation?

Compliance; or as **evidence** for an employment action; or to **justify** categorization, rating or rank ordering for an employment action or compensation consideration

REALITY

- We live in a world of measurement
- Evaluation is part of a cycle **that begins with hiring**
- **Can be** an effective tool for improving performance
- **Should be** strategic in nature
- Can help defend against litigation
- Support promotion decisions or discharge decisions

Remember...effective performance evaluation is not an **event**...but an ongoing feedback process...an extended conversation of sorts

EVALUATIONS: (ALMOST) AS OLD AS CIVILIZATION

Third Century China— Job ratings of government officials

Early 1800s — Scottish cotton mills ranking employees

Mid-1900s — Cubicle “farms,” numerical scales, rigid hierarchies

1980s — Jack Welch of G.E., “Rank and Yank”

1990s — Move toward competency-based systems

2000s — More frequent, less structured, multi-sourced

Traditional performance management is outdated ideas and principles.



DEFINING COMPETENCE

Today, we will focus on **competency...**

- Competence is defined as knowledge, skills, abilities, attitudes, and other characteristics that high performing employees regularly exhibit
- Can be technical or behavioral or both
- You “know it when you see it”, but.....
- Should be able to be observed or measured against a set of expectations or criteria
 - Criterion referenced

BASIC TALENT EQUATION

Talent = **Competence** x Commitment x Contribution

Competence should be assessed prior to hiring and affirmed/developed through the evaluation process

Commitment and Contribution are measured through the evaluation process (cannot be adequately assessed until after you've employed and come to deeply know the individual)



TYPES OF PERFORMANCE APPRAISALS

- Traditional **Formative** (periodic checkpoints – the more frequent, the better)
- Traditional **Summative** (typically an annual summation event)
- **Portfolio** (evidence-based)
- **360-Degree Feedback Based** (multiple perspectives)
- **Team-Oriented** (emphasizes team feedback)
- **Combination 360-Degree and Traditional**
 - *Provides confidential feedback on competence and behaviors for development purposes and makes traditional measurements of the employee's accomplishments or results which can be used for rewards or merit increases*

ESSENCE OF EVALUATION

Effective evaluation is part of an on-going conversation. The conversation is your leadership

Why?

- Because leadership is a human-to-human phenomenon
- It requires trust
- Trust is built on communication and social cues
- Face-to-face communication is the most reliable
- “Actions are louder than words”
- Humans look for congruency

FEEDBACK VS. MENTORING VS. COACHING

- **Feedback is informing/observing**
 - Provider describes workplace performance to help employee improve
 - Puts provider in role of responsibility for improving performance
 - Largely one-way communication
- **Mentoring is guiding/sharing**
 - Usually provided by veteran or senior staff
 - Provides guidance, perspective and knowledge
 - Typically does not oversee employee
 - Largely one-way; but can be two-way communication
- **Coaching is relating/asking**
 - Goal is self-actualization
 - Provider asks “powerful” questions: thought-provoking, challenging. stretching
 - Empowers the employee to examine and own their performance issues
 - Provider invites contribution from the employee about their own growth
 - Two-way conversation

RATINGS AND RANKINGS

- Can have a negative effect on employee engagement and performance
- Can provoke a “fight or flight” response that neutralizes a manager’s ability to coach and deliver feedback effectively
- Can be inaccurate based on biases
- Labels are often used to “categorize” employees

Remember...

- Employees should only be competing against their own personal best within a set of job standards!
- Brain categorizes inputs into two categories: threat or reward
 - That’s why “evaluation” has become such a fear-based experience

GROWTH VS. FIXED MINDSET - EVALUATION

<https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=M1CHPnZfFmU>

https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=_qICa4Llabg

GROWTH VS. FIXED MINDSET - EVALUATION

- **Fixed mindsets** prevent growth and development in **favor of doing things “as they’ve always been done.”**
- **The fixed mindset holds the belief that intelligence and talents are hardwired at birth**, which means that you either “have it” or you don’t based on your inherent nature, because it’s just who you are.
 - The annual summative performance evaluation process is an example of this mindset.
 - The **focus is a purely retrospective look** through an entire year’s performance and breaking it down rather than helping the employee focus on progress and real-time development
- **The feedback in these conversations is largely outdated, untimely, possibly vague and even irrelevant because it only deals with past actions.**

GROWTH VS. FIXED MINDSET - EVALUATION

- This manner of evaluation is proven to often **leave employees disheartened, defensive and demotivated.**
 - After all, nobody wants to sit through an entire year's worth of criticism, even if it is well-intended.
- By offering no opportunities for formative change, the typical annual performance review says nothing but **"either you have it or you don't."**
 - **Fixed mindset**
- Growth mind-set:
 - The simple truth is that **if you cannot help your employees grow, your competition will.**
 - It is the **belief that skills can always be improved and that failures are simply setbacks to be learned from.**

APPLYING A GROWTH MINDSET TO EVALUATION — CONTINUOUS PERFORMANCE MANAGEMENT

- Instead of, or along with, relying on an annual critique of past performance, **give your employees consistent, on-going, formative guidance toward goals and future goals.**
- An approach that is centered around **frequent, real-time feedback** will help them grow while keeping them on track to meet your organization's goals.
- On-going, formative feedback fuels the **growth mindset.**

THE IMPACT OF COACHING:

Each participant individually:

- Draw a tree, a rainbow, and stick-person.

Now group up: Coach and Artist(s)

- Coach use your instructions
- Artists follow the coaching you are given
 - Key
 - Cat
 - Snowman

CURRENT STATUS OF EVALUATION

Discuss the following at your table:

My Department/I evaluate employees every _____ year(s).

Exceptions to this include:

- new employees? How soon and how frequently?
- employees in need of improvement? How frequently? Improvement Plan document required?

Share

CURRENT STATUS OF EVALUATION

Discuss the following at your table:

You have been provided a number of sample evaluations from real school districts. Discuss:

- timeline and frequency?
- statement of purpose?
- clear criteria for success?
- open-ended opportunity for comments/details by evaluator?
- opportunity for evaluatee to comment?
- clarity about what happens next?
- Strengths? Weaknesses?
- Things you can use? Things that should change in the sample?

TRENDS IN PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

- Attention will **move from quantity to quality of conversations and feedback**
- Provide employees and managers with a **framework for having high-quality discussions and giving effective feedback**
 - Don't leave their conversation to chance; unstandardized may lead to very uneven results
- **Minimize** form-filling and bureaucracy
- Provide training for managers in **everyday coaching skills**
- **Synergize performance measurement/performance improvement conversations and informal feedback wherever possible**
 - **Include on-going coaching in addition to or part of a system of evaluation**

TRENDS IN PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

- Performance management systems will strive to be simple and **easy to understand**
- Companies **will change the way they manage performance-related pay and bonuses**
- The focus of performance management data will **shift from completion rates to manager impact (improved quality)**
- Companies **will increasingly be evaluating the quality and impact of performance management dialogue between managers and employees.**
 - Measuring the impact of evaluation

ACCURATE PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

The following tendencies can reduce the effectiveness of evaluations:

- **The Halo Effect:**

The tendency of an evaluator to rate a person good or bad on all characteristics based on an experience or knowledge involving only one dimension.

- **Leniency Tendency:**

A tendency towards evaluating all persons as outstanding and to give inflated ratings rather than true assessments of performance.

- **Strictness Tendency:**

The opposite of the leniency tendency; that is, a bias towards rating all persons at the low end of the scale and a tendency to be overly demanding or critical.

- **Average Tendency:**

A tendency to evaluate every person as average regardless of major differences in performance.

SETTING PERFORMANCE OBJECTIVES

❖ Effective objectives are:

- Observable and measurable
- Specific
- Constructive
- Relevant to the job requirements
- Within the employee's sphere of control
- Achievable (given time and resources)
- Limited in number

❖ When writing specific objectives, always include (ARC):

- A specific action
- A measurable result
- A time frame for completion

❖ Performance improvement plan should also include:

- Formative feedback
- Need for training or special direction
- Necessity for interim performance evaluation (frequent checking of progress)
- Identification of an Employee Assistance Program (if applicable)
- Personal improvement suggestions by employee

CONDUCTING THE EVALUATION MEETING

- Should allow an appropriate amount of time for discussion (typically, at least one half-hour)
- Create a positive, communicative atmosphere
- Begin by affirming the employee's abilities/contributions
- Be sensitive to employee feelings but be honest in your appraisal
- Make the evaluation a two-way dialogue
- Arrive at a mutual agreement for their growth (goals)
- Focus on the employee and their potential

Remember....Feedback Isn't Fatal! (and it shouldn't feel that way)

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION FOLLOW-UP

Performance evaluation is an ongoing responsibility

- Set a timetable for reviewing progress on goals – no surprises
- Help keep employee action plans/improvement plans on track
- Provide regular feedback on what is happening
- Maintain a dialogue on performance
 - Gives supervisor an opportunity to offer help and support
 - The more status checkpoints, the better

Employees need reinforcement to achieve and maintain high levels of performance

AVOIDING LIABILITY

- Maintain **an ongoing file** of performance throughout the year
- Do not refer to the employee's race, color, religion national origin, gender, sexual identity, sexual preference, age, marital status, height, weight, disability, or union affiliation
- Evaluate employees within a group on the same schedule/frequency
- Be forthright and candid (increases effectiveness)
- Be consistent
- Train your evaluators
- Make sure that judgements are supported by evidence
- Have the employee sign off on the receipt of the evaluation
- Make sure the evaluation addresses needs for the future
- Be aware of any bargaining unit provisions

RESOURCES

- [Mindset - Carol Dweck](#)
- [Neuroleadership Institute](#)
- [101 Sample Write-Ups for Documenting Employee Performance Problems – Paul Falcone](#)
- [Effective Phrases for Performance Appraisals – James E. Neal, Jr.](#)
- [The Crowd-sourced Performance Review – Eric Mosley](#)
- [Reinventing Performance Management, Harvard Business Review](#)
- [Help Them Grow, or Watch Them Go - by Beverly Kaye and Julie Winkle Giulioni](#)

QUESTIONS...

Rich Zuker

Director of Human Resources

Ottawa Area ISD

rzuker@oaisd.org

Thank you.